

**BOOK NOTES:
A WEB EDITION TO THE
YEARBOOK FOR TRADITIONAL MUSIC 48 (2016)**

(<http://ictmusic.org/ytm2016>)

Heath, Charles V. *The Inevitable Bandstand: The State Band of Oaxaca and the Politics of Sound*. Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2015. 218 pp., photographs, maps, charts, glossary, index. ISBN 978-0-8032-6967-5.

The Inevitable Bandstand: The State Band of Oaxaca and the Politics of Sound by Charles V. Heath is a timely contribution to the disciplines of musicology, Latin American studies, and history. While Oaxaca's economic development, migration patterns, and political and social movements are well documented in the academic literature, the cultural practices of Oaxaca, such as dance, fiesta, and music in relation to the political state, have not received the same in-depth scholarly attention. Heath's well-researched study of the *Banda de Música del Estado de Oaxaca* (State Band of Oaxaca) addresses this gap in the literature. More specifically, his focus on the State Band of Oaxaca ambitiously asks if music can be deployed as a political tool. In this monograph, Heath explores the influences of instrumentation, musical repertoire, and economics in sustaining the band across time, as well as its function within the State of Oaxaca. In doing so, the author provides a detailed historical and political trajectory, not only of Oaxaca, but also of the development of Mexico as a nation-state from the late eighteenth century to the early twentieth century.

Heath deftly uses the notion of "civil religion"—"where the state has replaced the church as the object of veneration contains element of religious theatricality"—to weave the State Band of Oaxaca's history together with the creation of Mexico's national identity (p. 21). Using extensive archival evidence and other primary sources, Heath skilfully illustrates the numerous functions the State Band of Oaxaca carried out on behalf of the state. He identifies two primary duties of the band: (1) to create a sense of unity within an ethnically and linguistically diverse state such as Oaxaca; and (2) to inculcate a sense of civic duty and patriotism during the consolidation of this modern state. In other words, civil religion assisted in the instillation of unity, loyalty, and patriotism within the diverse nation of Mexico, as well as in creating a national identity. Heath's archival research includes a collection of historical memos and programmes of civic celebrations, noting where citizens were offered opportunities to joyfully demonstrate their patriotism through music. His analysis of the civic religious calendar reveals the high frequency with which the state required musicians to play at state functions, in addition to services identified as either "ordinary" (i.e., Sundays matinees and evening concerts and weekday evening concerts) or "extraordinary" performances (i.e., presentations scheduled by the governor)(p. 112). While I found the blurring of civic loyalty

and religious practices in the everyday lives interesting, there were moments in the text when I felt Heath could have more carefully guided readers through the social contexts of civil religion.

By the turn of the twentieth century, civic loyalty was not as prominent a concern and government attention began to turn towards a tourism initiative. Oaxaca's well-known invented tradition, the music and dance spectacle called La Guelaguetza, is today at the centre of state interest in promoting tourism. *Guelaguetza* is a Zapotec word that signifies a pre-Columbian praxis of mutual reciprocity that continues to the present day in many communities. Heath references well-known anthropological texts that first documented the dance festival and its antecedents in Oaxaca. However, a number of contemporary scholars, writing in both English and Spanish, have more extensively and critically discussed the historical and contemporary performance of the Guelaguetza in relation to the Oaxacan state and, more importantly, to capitalist interests. Heath overlooks the cancellation of the Guelaguetza and corresponding activities due to the 2006 uprising stemming from ongoing political conflicts between the teachers' union and the Oaxacan state; the state has long and blatantly disregarded the basic human rights of its primary school educators (and citizens in general), and manipulated cultural practices in order to maintain social control.

In the final chapter, Heath questions whether or not the State Band of Oaxaca was successful in "teaching" Oaxacans to be citizens of a social democratic state (p. 118). His study demonstrates that, as political interests shifted over time, so did the function of the band. In other words, the State Band of Oaxaca sometimes proved successful in its teachings, while at other times, it did not. The way Heath presents the use of sound historically and the incorporation of music throughout various moments of national and international political campaigns in Mexico is very enlightening. From these points of encounter, this book offers a great opportunity for readers to expand their understandings of early forms of transnational forces in music, from the introduction of brass and woodwind instruments, to the printing, dissemination, and circulation of sheet music. The story Heath tells about the State Band of Oaxaca shows the band's continuing relevance: today it functions to educate a twenty-first-century audience on how a nation's musical identity was created through a repertoire as diverse as its citizens. Educators and students will find this text to be foundational to studies of cultural performance in Oaxaca.

XÓCHITL CHÁVEZ

Kheshti, Roshanak. *Modernity's Ear: Listening to Race and Gender in World Music.* New York: New York University Press, 2015. vii, 164 pp., bibliography, index. ISBN 9781479817863.

This research monograph is a continuation and refinement of research undertaken in the early 2000s by Roshanak Kheshti while working for a San Francisco-based world/electronica record company, referred to by the pseudonym, "Kinship Records" (p. 2). This book deals with four main issues, all of which relate to the

racialization and feminization of the world music cultural industry (WMCI): gender, invagination, fetishization, and hybridization/miscegenation. Kheshti defines world music as “the sounds of the other” and the cultural industry as the combination of both the academic and the commercial (p. 3). The first chapter looks at the role of women collectors (then referred to as “songcatchers”) in early phonographic recordings (p. 16). While the majority of comparative musicologists in the early twentieth century were men, many of the first phonographic recordings were made by women. These women, excluded from academia, worked for the Bureau of American Ethnology to “salvage” native music and language during a period of rapid loss and extermination (p. 19). Kheshti argues that the feminine aurality of these songcatchers is evident in these recordings: they privilege the listening event, where the sound input of the producer is as important as the sound input of the musicians.

In the second chapter, Kheshti uses psychoanalytic philosophy, namely that of Freud and Lacan, to theorize the “invagination” of the WMCI (p. 55). She uses the term “invagination,” both in the Derridean sense “in which sound, the listener’s body, escape, and affect fold in on one another” (p. 55) and in the physical sense of the ear’s capacity for incorporation as the voice penetrates the ear (p. 93). The ear, as the site of listening, is an organ to be penetrated by sonic force, and thus the act of listening to recordings, where the “invagination of pleasure becomes a means of capital accumulation,” becomes a heteronormative one (p. 72). Here Kheshti applies Freud’s notion of “uncanny” (the ego’s confrontation with the primitive self) and Lacan’s “mirror stage” (the misrecognition of the self and construction of a fictional identity around the image) to the two cultural processes of incorporation and appropriation (pp. 48–50). The WMCI promotes sonic and phonetic aspects of music over semantic and historical ones, acting as an intermediary and cultural translator for listeners who comprehend neither the lyrics nor the musical tradition presented. Kheshti argues that the process of consumption has been feminized through privileging the ear as the site of consumption due to its capacity to obtain pleasure through penetration, destruction, and appropriation of the object’s qualities. The third chapter shows how listening to music relates to the fetishized Other, Kristeva’s *signifiance*, and Barthes’ feminine *jouissance*, which results from the “loss of self” (p. 71). The space made through this loss is occupied by women as “not men” in the phallogocentric order. According to Kheshti, the aesthetics of musical pleasure are organized around the aural Other, bringing the feminine subject closer to the Lacanian prephallic, prepenetration site.

Chapter 4 applies Derrida’s concept of the “ear of the other” to the modern/traditional binary that results from the incorporation of the aural “other” into the “pleasure-in-listening” (p. 83). In this chapter, Kheshti also applies ideas from evolutionary biology, namely Darwinism, to the WMCI as an aesthetic and technological enactment of domestication. Music becomes a tool by which the civilization project of the West, through notation and recording, classifies and hierarchically orders the sonic world. The “loss of self” and “pleasure-in-listening” result from western listeners’ flirtation with the dangerousness of “racial noise” (Kheshti’s amendment to Attali’s theory of noise)(p. 96). The WMCI, which

privileges western musical elements, feminizes racial noise by neutering the racialized masculinity that could cause displeasure to the ear through unintelligibility (p. 97–104). The feminized voices (the Others in the foreground) are combined with masculine production values (the western aesthetics in the background) to create new, hybrid sounds that, as Kheshti explains through the trope of heterosexual procreation, are “blended imperceptibly” (p. 103). This hybridization privileges western aesthetics as the sole signifier of modernity. In the final chapter, Kheshti reflects on her experience in the WMCI as she, in Horkheimer and Adorno’s terms, “passes through the filter of the cultural industry,” skilfully bringing together the dense theoretical framework laid out in the previous chapters (p. 109). Here, the “pleasure-in-listening” results from listeners’ ability to imagine the racialized and gendered meanings of the music they hear (p. 116).

Kheshti’s analysis flows from one chapter to the next as she bridges her theoretical framework from different directions. She approaches her principal question—why most of Kinship Record’s listeners were white women—using theories and methodologies of many disciplines: psychoanalysis, ethnic studies, gender studies, evolutionary biology, linguistics, sound studies, and media studies. This book is exemplary in its depth and focus, and would benefit a readership in any of the aforementioned fields. Kheshti’s work can be applied to the global phenomenon of music hybridization, wherein western aesthetics are privileged as a modernizing force (and a masculine one) and the Other aesthetic is viewed as exclusively traditional (feminine). This expands previous work on hybridity, such as that by Néstor García Canclini, by adding a gendered lens. While later chapters might be difficult for casual readers, the first chapter would work well paired with the 2012 film *Songcatcher* for advanced students in a seminar setting. The theoretical framework of the section on psychoanalysis in the second chapter becomes quite thick and opaque at times, but this problem is resolved when Kheshti circles back to concrete examples. My main criticism of the book is the author’s failure to provide easy access to auditory and visual examples; however, I understand that the lack of recording and pictorial examples is related to the decision to use a pseudonym for the record label. Kheshti compensates for this lack by giving rich descriptions of specific pieces, liner notes, and images where relevant to the theoretical framework. I strongly recommend this book and think that it greatly enriches the disciplines from which Kheshti draws.

INDERJIT N. KAUR

Schultz, Anna C. *Singing a Hindu Nation: Marathi Devotional Performance and Nationalism*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013. xii, 231 pp., glossary, bibliography, index, music examples on companion website. ISBN 9780199730834.

In *Singing a Hindu Nation*, Anna Schultz offers a nuanced elucidation of nationalism through an account of its varied manifestations in the historical development of *rashtriya kīrtan* (lit., nationalist devotional song), a non-elite, regional subtype of

Hindu *kīrtan* performed in the western Indian state of Maharashtra. She provides an impressive interpretive analysis of the role of music in a significant contemporary socio-political problem: Hindutva, that is, Hindu primacy. Yet this book offers value well beyond area studies. Schultz's skilful ethnography, incisive reading of data, crisp theorization, and accessible presentation make her book instructive for a broader readership on devotional music, as well as music and politics.

Schultz argues that listeners of *rashtriya kīrtan* are unwittingly co-opted into religious nationalism through emotional and embodied experiences generated by a skilful mix of song and storytelling, with historical references to devotional and nationalistic figures that interweave the familiar and the authoritative. Through her detailed examination of this performance genre and its socio-political contexts, Schultz foregrounds the significance of several processes: (1) the role of regional culture and non-elites in nationalism; (2) the force of the devotional in nationalist politics; (3) the capacity of music to infuse national religious politics into the devotional; and (4) the effectiveness of music for reinforcement of power hierarchies. She nuances her arguments with an insightful elucidation of "parallel nationalisms" (p. 12) as an alternative to Partha Chatterjee's theory of separate inside/outside spheres of spirituality/materiality in anti-colonial nationalism (p. 9–12). Her analysis thus makes an important intervention in the literature on nationalism in India, which tends to focus on the role of elites.

Schultz perceptively recognizes a number of affective means that the *kīrtankār* (performers) use to promote their ideology. Sonically, sung and spoken genres are brought into skilful conversation in the performance of *rashtriya kīrtan*. Schultz analyses this interaction using Bakhtin's concept of "dialogue" and Bauman's application of that concept to spoken genres along with intertextuality, as well as Erving Goffman's treatment of collusion in his theory of frames. In this way Schultz theorizes a "collision of genres" (p. 174) that "almost imperceptibly" (p. 188) enlists a "collusion of participants" (p. 174). In terms of imagery, celebrated Maharashtrian nationalist heroes are evoked along with saints through lyrics, enactments, and song genres with devotional and militaristic associations, thus positioning the audience members as nationalists and the *kīrtankār* as a saint. Schultz analyses this imagery in terms of Peircean semiotics. Schultz also describes a physical transformation effected through the transformative power of call-and-response participatory singing embedded within virtuosic solo song and storytelling, which allows the nationalist evoked in the audience to merge with the saint evoked in the *kīrtankār*. To analyse this transformation, Schultz uses Csordas's concept of embodiment. She concludes that the result of this rich blend is a "blurring of boundaries" (p. 193) for listeners between devotion and nationalist politics.

At the same time Schultz recognizes that "participants at a *kīrtan* are not blank slates, and many come to the *kīrtan* already feeling an affinity toward the political and religious philosophies of the *kīrtankār*, and the experience only serves to strengthen their preexisting sentiments" (p. 194). Thus she points to the important issue of the agency of listeners, something that typically has been overlooked in the ethnomusicological literature on nationalism. As Schultz

writes, “Some *kīrtankār* recognized that nationalism seems to draw the largest and most enthusiastic crowds” (p. 194). This raises the question of the role of listener preferences in their participation in *rashtriya kirtan*’s “performance of harsh stereotypes of minorities” (p. 194), as well as the change over time in performance style toward “genres of aggression and bravery” (p. 193).

Fundamental questions concern listeners’ awareness of their inclination toward nationalistic significations: are they cognizant of the fact that the literal name of this *kīrtan* subtype is “nationalist devotional song”? Or even that it is different from other forms of Marathi Hindu *kīrtan*? Are the attendees regulars, and do they listen to recorded *rashtriya kirtan* in their homes? What sorts of literature do they read? Which television shows and films do they watch? And what are the nationalist tropes that circulate around them? In what ways do they register *kirtan* chanting in street processions of local nationalist political groups? Do they or their family members participate in other nationalist socio-cultural and political activities? Schultz’s perceptive study opens up these important research questions. Ethnographically generated data from listeners would shed light on the extent of participating audiences’ agency and their responsibility in providing momentum to Hindutva, and thereby on the significant problem of the driving forces of exclusionary power politics. In a study on voter political tolerance in the neighbouring north-central state of Madhya Pradesh, Widmalm and Oskarsson (2013:556) find that the median voter is “fairly intolerant” with respect to religious, political, and caste differences, irrespective of party affiliation, and point to a serious potential implication: that religious nationalism could become politically expedient across parties. As Schultz notes of her *kīrtankār* interlocutors, they viewed Hindutva as an abiding truth beyond the vagaries of politics (p. 96).

By tackling Hindutva, an issue of increasing importance in contemporary India and its Hindu diaspora (Kinnvall and Svensson 2010), *Singing a Hindu Nation* achieves a timely and soundly (pun intended) analysed exposition of its grassroots momentum, showing how it is propelled by regional, non-elite devotional music. The book is alert to varied interpretations of Hindu nationalism by *kirtan* performers who align with different degrees of extremism, as well as to the trend in which the popularity of conservative *kīrtankār* grows alongside the resurgence of Hindutva (p. 193). Schultz also makes a fine contribution to the scholarly conversation on gender ideology in Hindutva, which has argued that while women are used in leadership positions in its performance, it maintains the dominant paradigm of their inferior social status (Soherwordi 2013).

Through this remarkable monograph, Schultz has turned our attention to the complex set of factors that undergird a contemporary issue of major significance. Her informative study alerts us to the harmful work that music can do, even devotional and non-elite music, and reminds us that our understandings of music’s role in the lives of subalterns need to be counterbalanced by the awareness of its potential in the hands of the dominant for purposes of exclusion.

References cited

Kinnvall, Catarina, and Ted Svensson

2010 "Hindu Nationalism, Diaspora Politics and Nation-building in India." *Australian Journal of International Affairs* 64/3: 274–92.

Soherwordi, Syed Hussain Shaheed

2013 "Hindu Nationalism and the Political Role of Hindu Women: Ideology as a Factor." *South Asian Studies* 28/1: 39–54.

Widmalm, Sten, and Sven Oskarsson

2013 "Political Tolerance in India: Descriptions and Explanations from the Heartland." *Asian Survey* 53/3: 533–58.

RUTH MUELLER

Contributors

Xóchitl Chávez received her PhD in cultural anthropology (emphasis in Latin American and Latino Studies) from the University of California, Santa Cruz in 2013. She is an assistant professor at University of California, Riverside Department of Music. Dr. Chávez was recently appointed as the Digital Curator and Content Specialist for the Smithsonian Latino Center Digital Initiative.

Inderjit N. Kaur just completed her dissertation in ethnomusicology at the University of California, Berkeley, and is currently a lecturer there in the department of music. Her research on Sikh *sabad kīrtan* (sung sacred-poetry) and its various musical genres explores affective listening as a site of embodied knowledge. She has obtained diplomas in North Indian classical music and the South Indian classical dance, Bharat Natyam, and grew up singing *sabad kīrtan* in the classical genre. Her publications include articles in the 2016 *Yearbook for Traditional Music* and the 2011 edition of the *Journal of Punjab Studies*, and thirteen entries on India in *Grove Music Online* (forthcoming).

Ruth Mueller received her PhD in ethnomusicology from The University of Sheffield in 2013 and is currently a lecturer of music and culture at Washington University in St. Louis. Her research interests lie in South Korean traditional music, cultural preservation, identity, and women's studies. Ruth is the editor of the *Association for Korean Music Research Newsletter* and the book and CD review editor of *Asian Musicology*.